Export Controls in Academic Research

Dan Vick
Director of Export Controls
Learning Objectives

• What is an export?
• What are export controls?
• How do export controls impact research?
• What are some compliance strategies?
What is an export?
What is an Export?

• **Physical Export:**
  – International transfer of commodities, goods, or software regardless of method (i.e. shipments or hand carried goods).

• **Technology Export:**
  – Release of technology, technical data, or know-how to a foreign person or destination – via any method including conversations, email, fax, internet posting, shared servers.

• **Deemed Export:**
  – Release of technology to a foreign person *present* in the U.S. The release is “deemed” to be an export to the recipient’s home country. (home country interpreted differently in regulations)
Release?

- Visual or other inspection by a foreign person of items that reveals “technology” or source code to a foreign person; or

- Oral or written exchanges with a foreign person of “technology” or source code in the United States or abroad.

- Any act causing a release.
  - Ex. sharing keys or passwords
Technology?

• **Information** needed to develop, use*, manufacture, or improve an item.

*Extent of “use” definition depends on item.
US or Foreign Person?

• US Person = U.S. citizens, Permanent Resident Green Card Holders, or recipients of Political Asylum status

• Foreign Person / Foreign National = any non-US person.
What is NOT an Export?

• Sharing information that exists wholly within the public domain (i.e. any interested party may access it, without restriction)
  – “Fundamental Research” where the results are ordinarily published and shared broadly within the research community

• Providing physical goods or services to a foreign person within the US for their domestic use
  – As long as controlled “technology” is not released
Fundamental Research

• Research in science, engineering, or mathematics, the results of which ordinarily are published and shared broadly within the research community, and for which the researchers have not accepted restrictions for proprietary or national security reasons.
What are export controls?
What Are Export Controls?

• Multiple sets of regulations.
• Controls on
  – Specific lists of technology
  – Sanctions and embargoes
  – Financial and trade activities
Why Control Exports?

• Prevent the diversion of potentially sensitive or militarily adaptable items to other countries.
• Restrict the export of goods and technologies that could directly and indirectly contribute to the military potential of other countries [DUAL USE technology].
• Regulate economic activities in accordance with US foreign policy.
Who Controls Exports?

Office of Foreign Asset Controls (OFAC)

Bureau of Industry and Security (BIS)

Directorate of Defense Trade Controls (DDTC)

National Nuclear Security Administration (NNSA)

Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC)
What is controlled?

• Items and Technology:
  – Each regulating agency maintains a list of controlled technologies.
  – Lists include military, dual-use, and nuclear technology.
  – Lists are updated periodically.
What is controlled?

• Activities of “US Persons” outside of the US.
  – Embargoes
  – Sanctions
  – Various Services (defense, nuclear power, finance)
How Are Exports Controlled?

• Controlled Technology lists
• Prohibited end uses & activities
• Sanctions and Embargoes
• Restricted parties
Regulations

**ITAR**
- International Traffic in Arms Regulations
- Controls items & technology specially designed/developed for military/space

**EAR**
- Export Administration Regulations
- Controls Commercial/“Dual Use” items & technology

**OFAC**
- Office of Foreign Asset Controls
- Sanctions & embargos on foreign nations/individuals

**DOE**
- Department of Energy
- Controls export of nuclear power generating equipment & materials
What is Controlled?

- Controlled Technology lists [what]
- Prohibited end uses & activities [why]
- Sanctions and Embargoes [where]
- Restricted parties [who]
• Controls export of US origin “defense articles” listed on the US Munitions List (USML)

I. Firearms, Close Assault Weapons and Combat Shotguns
II. Guns and Armament
III. Ammunition/Ordnance
IV. Launch Vehicles, Guided Missiles, Ballistic Missiles, Rockets, Torpedoes, Bombs, and Mines
V. Explosives and Energetic Materials, Propellants, Incendiary Agents, and Their Constituents
VI. Surface Vessels of War and Special Naval Equipment
VII. Ground Vehicles
VIII. Aircraft and Related Articles
IX. Military Training Equipment and Training
X. Personal Protective Equipment
XI. Military Electronics
XII. Fire Control, Range Finder, Optical and Guidance and Control Equipment
XIII. Materials and Miscellaneous Articles
XIV. Toxicological Agents, Including Chemical Agents, Biological Agents, and Associated Equipment
XV. Spacecraft and Related Articles
XVI. Nuclear Weapons Related Articles
XVII. Classified Articles, Technical Data, and Defense Services Not Otherwise Enumerated
XVIII. Directed Energy Weapons
XIX. Gas Turbine Engines and Associated Equipment
XX. Submersible Vessels and Related Articles
XXI. Articles, Technical Data, and Defense Services Not Otherwise Enumerated
### EAR

- Controls US origin commercial and dual-use goods listed on the Commerce Control List (CCL):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0:</td>
<td>Nuclear Materials Facilities &amp; Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:</td>
<td>Materials, Chemicals, Microorganisms and Toxins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:</td>
<td>Materials Processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:</td>
<td>Electronics: Systems, Equipment &amp; Components</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:</td>
<td>Computers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:</td>
<td>Part 1 - Telecommunications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:</td>
<td>Part 2 - Information Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:</td>
<td>Sensors &amp; Lasers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:</td>
<td>Navigation &amp; Avionics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:</td>
<td>Marine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:</td>
<td>Aerospace and Propulsion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DOE

- Controls exports of nuclear power generating equipment and materials:
  - nuclear reactors
  - uranium enrichment facilities
  - spent fuel reprocessing plants
  - uranium and plutonium conversion plants
  - heavy water or deuterium production plants
  - nuclear fuel fabrication plants
  - lithium isotope separation facilities
  - deuterium (heavy water)

- equipment, component parts, and assemblies that are especially designed or prepared for exclusive use in any of the aforementioned facilities
- special nuclear material
- source material (e.g., natural and depleted uranium, thorium)
- byproduct material
- nuclear grade graphite for nuclear end use
OFAC

- Individual sanctions program for each target.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Balkans</th>
<th>North Korea*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>Somalia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burundi</td>
<td>Sudan/Darfur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central African Republic</td>
<td>South Sudan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba*</td>
<td>Syria*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iran*</td>
<td>Ukraine/Russia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>Venezuela</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon</td>
<td>Yemen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Libya</td>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Counter Narcotics Trafficking
Counter Terrorism
Cyber-related
Sergei Magnitsky related
Non-Proliferation
Rough Diamond Trade
Transnational Criminal Organizations

*comprehensive
End-User Controls

• Restricted Parties Lists – includes universities, hospitals, research institutes

• State, Commerce, and Treasury each have their own lists

• Exports to listed entities or individuals are prohibited
Prohibited End Uses and Services

- Rocket Systems
- Military Training
- Chemical/Bio Weapons
- Nuclear Energy or Weapons
- Terrorism
- Trafficking – weapons, drugs, humans, animals
Other export compliance issues
Anti-boycott

• EAR and IRS rules
• Under US law it is illegal to comply with boycotts that are:
  – Unsanctioned by the US, and
  – Fostered by one foreign country against another
    • Primarily applies to national boycotts of Israel
When working with foreign government officials, it is illegal to provide “anything of value” in order to obtain an unfair advantage.

“Government officials” may include:
- Foreign government employees and politicians
- Public international organizations (e.g. the World Bank)
- Employees of foreign state owned or affiliated entities, including:
  - Doctors in state owned or operated hospitals
  - Professors in public universities
  - Purchasing agents at state owned manufacturers
  - Family members of the above individuals

“Anything of value” may include:
- Cash or services
- Lavish gifts
- Payment of travel expenses
- Loans
- Charitable contributions
- Financial aid or scholarships
- Excessive entertainment expenses
- Title of honor

“Unfair advantage” may include:
- Influencing an official act or decision
- Obtaining or retaining business or funding
- Portraying “competitors” poorly
- Ensuring the lack of prosecution for illegal activity
- Securing special tax or customs treatment
Why bother?

- Institutional & Individual liability
- Penalties
  - Fines
  - Imprisonment
  - Debarment
  - Loss of export privileges
Export Activities

• Research
• Physical Exports
• Travel
• Hosting Foreign Person Visitors
Export Activities

• Physical exports
• Travel
• Hosting Foreign Person Visitors
Research

• Public Domain information is not subject to export controls.
• Information released in catalogue courses and teaching labs is not subject to export controls. [Education exclusion]
• Information that arises from “fundamental research” is considered to be in the Public Domain.
Fundamental Research Exclusion

• Research in science, engineering, or mathematics, the results of which ordinarily are published and shared broadly within the research community, and for which the researchers have not accepted restrictions for proprietary or national security reasons.
Fundamental Research Exclusion

- FRE applies to information only
- Physical items developed through fundamental research are subject to export controls
- Physical items exported to be used in fundamental research are subject to export controls
Fundamental Research Exclusion

• Research contracts and grants may contain clauses that prevent use of the FRE
  – Publication restrictions
  – Access restrictions
  – Proprietary inputs
Problematic Clauses

Prior approval to use NON-U.S. citizens to perform on this contract, at either the prime or sub-contract level must be obtained from the Contracting Officer and the Director, Intelligence and Security Directorate. However, if approval is granted, such approval does not grant an exception to U.S. export law(s) and the contractor is responsible for obtaining necessary export licenses.

(d) Equipment and technical data generated or delivered under this contract are controlled by the International Traffic in Arms Regulation (ITAR), 22 CFR Sections 121

The contractor shall not release to anyone outside the Contractor's organization any unclassified information, regardless of medium (e.g., film, tape, document), pertaining to any part of this contract or any program related to this contract, unless the Contracting Officer has given prior written approval.

There shall be no dissemination or publication of information developed under this contract or contained in the reports to be furnished pursuant to this contract without prior written approval of the Contracting Officer.

DFARS 252.204-7000
Research Projects

Input

- Information with no publication or dissemination restrictions:
  - Published Research
  - Public Domain Info
  - Educational Information

- Confidential or Proprietary Information
  - DD2345
  - Controlled Unclassified Information (CUI)
  - “US Persons only”

Output

- Freely Publishable Results

Public Domain

Non-Public Domain

- Non-publishable results (not allowed by sponsor)
  - May require review and approval
Research Projects: Not Controlled

Input
- Information with no publication or dissemination restrictions:
  - Published Research
  - Public Domain Info
  - Educational Information

Output
- Freely Publishable Results

Public Domain
- Non-Public Domain

Confidential or Proprietary Information
- DD2345
- Controlled Unclassified Information (CUI)
- “US Persons only”

Non-publishable results (not allowed by sponsor)
- May require review and approval
Research Projects: Controlled

Input

Information with no publication or dissemination restrictions:
- Published Research
- Public Domain Info
- Educational Information

Confidential or Proprietary Information
- DD2345
- Controlled Unclassified Information (CUI)
- “US Persons only”

Output

Freely Publishable Results

Non-publishable results (not allowed by sponsor)
May require review and approval

Public Domain

Non-Public Domain
## Research Projects: Controlled

### Input

- Information with no publication or dissemination restrictions:
  - Published Research
  - Public Domain Info
  - Educational Information

- Confidential or Proprietary Information
  - DD2345
  - Controlled Unclassified Information (CUI)
    - “US Persons only”

### Output

- Freely Publishable Results

- Non-publishable results (not allowed by sponsor)
  - May require review and approval

### Domain

- **Public Domain**
- **Non-Public Domain**
Research Projects: Controlled

**Input**
- Information with no publication or dissemination restrictions:
  - Published Research
  - Public Domain Info
  - Educational Information

**Output**
- Freely Publishable Results

**Public Domain**
- Non-published results (not allowed by sponsor)
- May require review and approval

**Non-Public Domain**
- Confidential or Proprietary Information
  - DD2345
  - Controlled Unclassified Information (CUI)
  - "US Persons only"
The Subject Matters

• Export Controls vary by:
  – Item
  – Technology
  – Destination
Compliance Strategies

• In an export controlled situation?
  – Re-design the activity
  – Technology Control Plans
  – Export Licenses
Technology Control Plan

- Transmission / Receipt
- Physical security
- IT security
- Authorized personnel
- Storage
- Closeout and disposal
Export Licenses

- USG written permission to conduct an otherwise prohibited export.
- Submit TCP to USG for approval along with other license requirements.
- Periodic audits and evaluations.
Export Licenses

• Application process can be long
• No guarantee of approval
• Licenses may come with conditions
• Licenses authorize only the specific transaction(s) listed
Regulatory vs. Contractual

- Sponsored research agreements may carry heavier controls based on contractual clauses.
  - Technology may not be export controlled, but is proprietary to sponsor.
When am I going to have to deal with this?

- Long term storage
- Disposition
- Problematic clauses in RFP/BAA?
- License or TCP training
- Can we claim FRE?
- Shipping and Travel
- Negotiate out publication or access restrictions
- Periodic audits
- License applications or TCP
- Proposal & Budget Development
- Sponsored Project Life Cycle
- Proposal & Budget Submission
- Project End & Closeout
- Award & Project Management
- Award & Project Set Up
Questions?
Case Study

What’s the worst that could happen?
Research Case Study

• Violation in 2008 / Sentencing in 2012
• Faculty member charged with 14 ITAR violations stemming from a research sub award, flowed down from USAF
• Sentenced to 48 months in prison
Research Case Study

• Plasma actuator developed in University lab by professor and a grad student.
• Grad student licensed this technology and formed a start-up.
• Start-up obtained an R&D contract from USAF to adapt tech for a military drone system.
• Subcontract to University to collaborate on development (< $10k)
ITAR

• Controls export of US origin “defense articles” enumerated on US Munitions List (USML)

I. Firearms, Close Assault Weapons and Combat Shotguns
II. Guns and Armament
III. Ammunition/Ordnance
IV. Launch Vehicles, Guided Missiles, Ballistic Missiles, Rockets, Torpedoes, Bombs, and Mines
V. Explosives and Energetic Materials, Propellants, Incendiary Agents, and Their Constituents
VI. Surface Vessels of War and Special Naval Equipment
VII. Ground Vehicles
VIII. Aircraft and Related Articles
IX. Military Training Equipment and Training
X. Personal Protective Equipment
XI. Military Electronics
XII. Fire Control, Range Finder, Optical and Guidance and Control Equipment
XIII. Materials and Miscellaneous Articles
XIV. Toxicological Agents, Including Chemical Agents, Biological Agents, and Associated Equipment
XV. Spacecraft and Related Articles
XVI. Nuclear Weapons Related Articles
XVII. Classified Articles, Technical Data, and Defense Services Not Otherwise Enumerated
XVIII. Directed Energy Weapons
XIX. Gas Turbine Engines and Associated Equipment
XX. Submersible Vessels and Related Articles
XXI. Articles, Technical Data, and Defense Services Not Otherwise Enumerated
CATEGORY VIII—AIRCRAFT AND RELATED ARTICLES

(a) Aircraft, whether manned, unmanned, remotely piloted, or optionally piloted, as follows (MT if the aircraft, excluding manned aircraft, has a range equal to or greater than 300 km):

*(1) Bombers;
*(2) Fighters, fighter bombers, and fixed-wing attack aircraft;
*(3) Turboprop- or turbojet-powered trainers used to train pilots for fighter, attack, or bomber aircraft;
*(4) Attack helicopters;
*(5) Unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs) specially designed to incorporate a defense article;
*(6) [Reserved]
*(7) Aircraft specially designed to incorporate a defense article for the purpose of performing an intelligence, surveillance, and reconnaissance function;
*(8) Aircraft specially designed to incorporate a defense article for the purpose of performing an electronic warfare function; airborne warning and control aircraft; or aircraft specially designed to incorporate a defense article for the purpose of performing a command, control, and communications function;
*(9) Aircraft specially designed to incorporate a defense article for the purpose of performing an air refueling function;
Research Case Study

- Prime and sub-award contained export control clauses.
- Work required UAV technical data inputs from AF.
- Professor involved 2 foreign national grad students on this project.
- Professor traveled to China with project data on his laptop.
- Students emailed project data to colleagues in China.
What Went Wrong?

- Contract terms were ignored. Why?
  - Plasma actuator technology was widely published and in the public domain
Research Projects: Controlled

Input

Information with no publication or dissemination restrictions:
- Published Research
- Public Domain Info
- Educational Information

Output

Freely Publishable Results

Confidential or Proprietary Information
- DD2345
- Controlled Unclassified Information (CUI)
- “US Persons only”

Non-publishable results (not allowed by sponsor)
May require review and approval

Public Domain

Non-Public Domain
What Went Wrong?

• Contract terms were ignored. Why?
  – Plasma actuator technology was widely published and in the public domain
  – Foreign national students were best technical resources in the lab
  – Professor disagreed with export control determination
What Went Wrong?

• USAF contract was part of development of a larger weapons system.
• Contract language did not permit the Fundamental Research Exclusion
Could This Have Been Avoided?

• YES!
• Pre-award review and negotiation
• Scope University work as fundamental research
• If this fails – apply for licenses to include students
Thank You!